

From: Nandini Ranganathan <yoganirupana@gmail.com>
Date: 11 April 2011 05:35:36 GMT+01:00
Subject: **Yoga Makaranda -- update**

Dear all,

I am writing to update you on the status of our translation of Krishnamacharya's Yogamakaranda, and on that of the plagiarised edition brought out by Kausthub Desikachar (Yoga Makaranda, The Nectar of Yoga). Many of you have written offering us your sympathy and your appreciation for our translation. I am grateful for the messages and will eventually try to reply individually to each one.

I want to strongly refute any suggestion that there has been any fair attempt at moderation between ourselves and kym/khyf or that we (my mother and I) have received or accepted any apology to our satisfaction. Some of you may have received a message or seen a notice on the website of khyf (that seems to be evolving over time) insinuating that this is the case. This is yet another effort by Kausthub to stall, deliberately mislead, and deceive while he works on a "revised edition" of a plagiarised publication.

My mother reluctantly agreed to meet with Kausthub as, in spite of his consistent dishonesty in previous communications, she still really did wish to give him a chance to offer a sincere apology and make amends. They met informally in the house of a trustee of KYM (hardly a neutral observer, as she had never really even spoken to him previously, while he has known Kausthub's family for many years). This kym trustee did not give her any opportunity to speak and she was unable to voice her opinions. Kausthub later sent a draft letter of apology that was completely unacceptable to both of us, and my mother repeatedly replied, clearly stating that the letter did not meet with our approval and that it should not be sent out as an apology. Yet Kausthub implies, publicly, that an agreement was reached that was satisfying to all. The message contained in the website (which has since disappeared and has been replaced by more and more bizarre iterations) is completely insincere and dishonest as it does not admit to what actually happened.

The implication (in Kausthub's ongoing communications and in his web posting) that his errors have been only unintentional and inadvertent is also misleading. I had specifically asked Kausthub in an email message in November to make sure that he or kym did not use any part of our translation in any publication and he assured us that he would not. One would assume that, as editor, he would actually look at a final draft and proof of the manuscript, and that he would recognize such extensive use of our translation. Or is he admitting to not really editing the book either? We also never ever submitted a manuscript to "Media Garuda", only to Sri Desikachar for publication by KYM.

Kausthub has admitted to using our work for significant portions of his own book, and has promised to withdraw the book. But at the same time he is attempting to announce a new revised version, which will be sent out as a replacement. Not only does this violate all ethical practice in publishing -- a refund should be automatically tendered to all who unknowingly purchased a plagiarised text, and the same authors and editors cannot be trusted to produce a new book on the same subject -- it also gives the impression that the initial work contained only a few small errors, that could be quickly corrected. As I wrote in my previous message, this is not at all the case, as this publication uses entire sections of our translation. In fact, the part of our translation used in Kausthub's book comprises the entire chapter on asana (more than half the book: pg 111 --- 205 out of pages 63 --- 205) as well as other sections of earlier chapters. For a publisher to appropriate, publish, and sell material created by others without permission and attribution is extremely unethical as well as illegal. I would like to observe that while other translations may have been available to Sri Desikachar over the years, he told us in 2006 that he was unsatisfied with any that he had previously seen, and this can also be inferred from the fact that he chose not to publish those earlier efforts as a complete text.

From the beginning, our interest has not been in personal gain, but only in seeing that Krishnamacharya's text be properly translated and not published in this dishonest way. We feel that this is only in keeping with the spirit of Krishnamacharya and his Yogamakaranda, commissioned and published by the Maharajah of Mysore, which on first publication in the 1930's was distributed free to the schools in Mysore, with the intention of spreading the learning of yoga (viz. Desikachar, Health Healing and Beyond. Yoga and the Living Tradition of Krishnamacharya, p. 90).

We have received a great deal of support since bringing this issue to the notice of the yoga community, from teachers, from students, and from members of Krishnamacharya's family. We are very grateful for the trust that all of you have afforded us, and we deeply regret any embarrassment and pain that this episode may have caused other members of Krishnamacharya's family. We both fully understand that they were not involved and would not countenance such behavior. It is unfortunate that, because of Kausthub's hasty publication of this book, I had no option but to publicize, after the fact, its deceitful origin and invalidity.

In light of the continued unethical behaviour on part of the editor, publisher, and the "khyf team", I ask that you as a yoga practitioner or scholar give serious thought to the implications of supporting persons or organisations involved in such behaviour. Naturally, each of you will make these judgements individually, but I believe that they should be made in an open, honest environment, knowing all of the relevant facts.

Once again, thank you all for your support.

--- nandini

p.s. I have attached a copy of the original message including a sample of plagiarism for context as well as a message from my mother. I would also be happy to send you a link for an electronic copy of our translation for use in research, study, or teaching.

I do not intend to write any more general updates until the situation is finally resolved. I just have received several queries about the "resolution" or "moderation" implied in messages from khyf and felt that it was important to clarify.

From: Nandini Ranganathan <yoganirupana@gmail.com>
Date: March 16, 2011 2:23:35 PM EDT
To: <<mailto:nandini.ranganathan@gmail.com>>
nandini.ranganathan@gmail.com
Subject: Yoga Makarandam

Dear all,

You are receiving this message since I have interacted with you in the context of yoga in some form or fashion. I wanted to let you know about some recent events that have occurred that I find extremely troubling.

As many of you already know, my mother Lakshmi Ranganathan and I translated Krishnamacarya's *Yoga Makarandam* in 2006. A few of you have copies that I distributed then and perhaps have shared them with others, and several of you have seen me using it in my classes since. We made just a few copies and gave one to Sri. Desikachar as he had been such an important person in both of our lives. He was extremely happy with it and after reading it carefully, let us know that it was an excellent translation that was true to his father's words and tone, and repeatedly said that he had not seen any other effort of this quality. He asked us whether we would allow KYM to publish it and he insisted that he would make sure that there was no censorship or revision. We agreed and I have an email from Kausthub in 2006 requesting and thanking me for receiving the electronic copy so that he could use it. Our only request was that the text be published without embellishment or distortion.

Nothing was done for several years. This past November, Kausthub sent us an email letting us know that the publication was ready and that he'd like to acknowledge our efforts and

Dear Friends,

Thank you for all the support and response from many of you.

Some of you know me from the 70s when I was part of the first set of teachers at KYM. For many of you who may not know me, I was a student of Sri. Desikachar from 1971 and had the privilege of being taught by Periyavar (Krishnamacharya) himself. I was in the Mandiram until 1986 when a few of us left and started the Sanjeevani Ayurveda & Yoga centre. I also teach Yoga at The School, belonging to the Krishnamurthy foundation of India and also at the Ramakrishna Mission. My daughter Nandini was a student of Desikachar and was very interested in studying the teachings of Krishnamacharya .

This led us to dedicate ourselves to translate the Yogamakaranda. It took us nearly a year as we wished to keep Krishnamacharya's words and message pristine and as close to his original words. T.M.Mukundan, my colleague in Sanjeevani (who was also a teacher in KYM) and Roopa, my student, helped us to edit the work. A friend of ours, Saravanakumar, a professional photographer, helped restore the images from the Tamil version of the book.

We presented a copy of our English translation to Sri.Desikachar in 2006. He was very happy with the work and stated that this was the closest to and a true translation of his father's book. He wished to have KYM publish our translation of Yogamakaranda. We consented happily on the condition that Krishnamacharya's original work should not be altered or diluted. When we discovered in November last year that these conditions were not working out, we withdrew our manuscript and made it very clear that no part of our translation or our names are to be used in any publication brought out by them. Nandini's letter explains what happened subsequently.

There is a misconception that I have readily accepted the misleading announcement on the KHYF website, which has been made with some deliberate intentions and is not true. Nor has there been any sincere apology. My husband, Ranganathan, and I had assisted in drafting the original constitution for KYM. I am always grateful to Sir for all that I have received from him. I hold him with great esteem and respect. Unfortunately, we have not been permitted to meet with Sir, at all, since this publication came out. I feel very sad and disheartened about all this.

As a yoga teacher, I believe strongly, that we have to maintain the principles of honesty and sincerity in our work. Thank you for your messages of support. Since I do not use emails frequently, you are also welcome to contact Nandini for more details.

Lakshmi Ranganathan
lakshmi.r.yoga@gmail.com